Assyfa Journal of Islamic Studies

AJIS. Vol. No. (2026) Page 665-670

e-ISSN: 2988-7399 p-ISSN: 2988-7399

https://doi.org/10.61650/ajis.v4i1.1368

ORIGINAL RESEARCH ARTICLE

Prophetic Deliberation and Its Implications for Islamic Education Management: A Textual Analysis

Umayah[1*], Feri Riski Dinata[1], Dwi Sugianik[1], Suwanto[1], Ismail Fahmi[1]

[1]*Institut Agama Islam Al Hikmah Lampung, Indonesia*

Correspondence: mayahum226@gmail.com

Article History: 20 February 2026 • Revised: 25 March 2025 • Accepted: 15 April 2026 • Published: 30 April 2026

ABSTRACT

This literature-based study examines deliberation (shura) in Qur'an 3:159 and 42:38 and considers selected accounts of the Prophet Muhammad's leadership for Islamic education management. Through close textual reading and comparison with leadership scholarship, it distinguishes the leader's ethical conduct during consultation from the community's practice of mutual decision-making. Four conceptual applications are developed: consultative planning, representative organization, accountable implementation, and constructive evaluation. Historical accounts associated with Badr and Uhud illustrate the discussion, but their contemporary application requires contextual interpretation. The analysis draws on selected passages and secondary sources rather than field data; it cannot establish whether consultation improves school outcomes. The proposed framework offers questions for educational leaders about participation, reasons for decisions, and responsibility for implementation, subject to further textual verification and empirical study.

Keywords: Deliberation; Prophetic Leadership; Shura; Islamic Education Management

ABSTRAK
Penelitian kepustakaan ini mengkaji musyawarah dalam QS Ali Imran [3]:159 dan QS Asy-Syura [42]:38 serta mempertimbangkan riwayat terpilih mengenai kepemimpinan Nabi Muhammad untuk manajemen pendidikan Islam. Pembacaan dan perbandingan tekstual membedakan sikap etis pemimpin dalam konsultasi dari praktik kolektif pengambilan keputusan. Empat penerapan konseptual dirumuskan: perencanaan konsultatif, pengorganisasian partisipasi, pelaksanaan yang akuntabel, dan evaluasi konstruktif. Riwayat terkait Badar dan Uhud menjadi ilustrasi yang perlu dipahami sesuai konteks sejarahnya. Analisis ini didasarkan pada ayat terpilih dan sumber sekunder, tanpa data lapangan; karena itu efektivitas musyawarah terhadap hasil pendidikan tidak dapat disimpulkan. Kerangka yang ditawarkan memerlukan verifikasi sumber sejarah dan penelitian empiris.

Kata kunci: Musyawarah; Kepemimpinan Nabi; Syura; Manajemen Pendidikan Islam

How to Cite: Umayah, Dinata, F. R., Sugianik, D., Suwanto, & Fahmi, I. (2026). Prophetic Deliberation and Its Implications for Islamic Education Management: A Textual Analysis. *Assyfa Journal of Islamic Studies*, *4*(1), 665–670. Retrieved from https://journal.assyfa.com/index.php/ajis/article/view/1368

1. INTRODUCTION

Deliberation (shura) is a prominent principle in Islamic approaches to collective decision-making. Qur'an 3:159 addresses the Prophet's gentleness, forgiveness, consultation, and trust in God after deciding; Qur'an 42:38 describes believers as conducting their affairs by mutual consultation. Together the passages provide a basis for studying both the conduct of a leader and the collective character of governance.

Islamic educational institutions make recurring decisions about curricula, staffing, student support, and the use of resources. A leadership approach grounded in consultation may give teachers and other stakeholders opportunities to contribute knowledge before decisions are taken. Such participation also requires clarity about who decides, which matters are open to consultation, and how dissenting opinions are recorded.

The source manuscript relates the two Qur'anic passages to accounts of consultation associated with the Prophet's leadership around the battles of Badr and Uhud. Historical reports require contextual reading: consultation in a military setting does not directly prescribe the procedures of a contemporary school. It can nevertheless inform a reasoned discussion of openness, responsibility, and review of decisions.

This article develops a conceptual reading of prophetic deliberation for Islamic education management. It asks how the ethical content of the passages and selected historical accounts might inform planning, organization, implementation, and evaluation. It offers an interpretive framework, not an empirical test of whether consultation improves institutional performance.

2. RESEARCH METHODS

The study is a literature-based textual analysis. Its primary normative texts are Qur'an 3:159 and 42:38, read alongside interpretations by Shihab, Hamka, and other commentators cited in

© 2026 Umayah & Dinata. Published by CV. Assyfa Tutoring, Indonesia

the supplied manuscript. Selected accounts of prophetic consultation are used as historical context. Research on participatory and educational leadership provides a comparative conceptual lens.

The analysis proceeds in four steps: close reading of each passage; comparison of their ethical and institutional emphases; contextual assessment of the historical examples; and translation of the resulting principles into possible management practices. This procedure distinguishes the meaning attributed to the texts from the authors' contemporary application to educational institutions.

Because this is a conceptual study, it involves no interview participants, classroom observation, survey, or impact evaluation. The proposed management applications are interpretations rather than demonstrated results. The selection of two passages and illustrative historical accounts limits claims about the breadth of the Qur'anic and prophetic corpus.

3. RESULTS AND FINDINGS

Qur'an 3:159 links consultation to the disposition of the leader: gentleness, forgiveness, asking pardon, and trust after reaching a decision. The passage can be read as a warning against harshness that drives people away. In this reading, shura involves how disagreement is handled as well as the procedural act of asking for opinions.

Qur'an 42:38 characterizes mutual consultation as part of the community's conduct of its affairs. Its emphasis is collective and ongoing rather than confined to a single leader's decision. Taken together, the two passages support a conceptual distinction between ethical leadership during consultation and arrangements that make consultation possible across an institution.

The source manuscript invokes reports concerning Badr to illustrate attention to companions' knowledge of practical conditions. It discusses Uhud as a context in which advice and the aftermath of an adverse outcome are considered alongside Qur'an 3:159. These episodes are historical illustrations in the present analysis; their precise details and interpretations should be checked against the primary historical and exegetical works before attributing particular actions or motives to the Prophet.

Four management applications follow from this reading. Planning can include structured consultation with relevant teachers and staff; organization can define representative roles and channels for proposals; implementation can assign clear responsibilities after a decision; and evaluation can provide a setting for examining results without automatically assigning blame. These applications are conceptual deductions rather than observations of an operating school.

The resulting framework emphasizes inclusive input, humility in listening, shared responsibility for implementation, and constructive review. Responsibility remains differentiated: consultation does not eliminate a leader's formal accountability or substitute for

© 2026 Umayah & Dinata. Published by CV. Assyfa Tutoring, Indonesia

lawful and professional requirements. Decisions still need transparent reasons and a mechanism for handling disagreements.

4. DISCUSSION

The two passages point to complementary dimensions of consultation. Qur'an 3:159 centers interpersonal conduct, while Qur'an 42:38 locates consultation in collective affairs. An educational leader could therefore assess both whether members can speak and whether the leader responds respectfully to disagreement.

Consultation in planning may broaden the knowledge available for decisions. Teachers understand classroom needs, administrators know operational limits, and families can explain students' circumstances. The extent of each group's participation should match the issue and respect confidentiality and designated authority.

At the organizational level, a deliberative practice needs more than an invitation to attend meetings. Meeting agendas, access to evidence, records of proposed options, and explanations of final decisions make participation traceable. Without these arrangements, consultation can remain symbolic even when a meeting formally takes place.

The proposed implementation principle distinguishes shared ownership from blurred accountability. Once a decision is reached, tasks and deadlines need named owners, and leaders remain answerable for matters within their authority. This interpretation preserves the practical role of management while taking community input seriously.

Post-decision review is especially relevant to the manuscript's reading of Uhud. An adverse result need not make participation itself illegitimate; it may require examining information, assumptions, implementation, and changing conditions. This is a contemporary managerial inference from the interpretive account, not a claim that the historical episode establishes a modern evaluation protocol.

Research on distributed and participatory leadership suggests that opportunities for staff voice can matter to institutional culture (Robinson et al., 2008; Spillane, 2006). That literature supplies a useful comparison but cannot itself verify the Qur'anic interpretation. Conversely, the ethical grounds advanced here do not prove measurable effects on teacher or student outcomes.

The literature method also has limitations. The analysis selects two verses and illustrative narratives, and different commentators can emphasize different legal, ethical, or contextual implications. Future work should compare a broader range of tafsir and hadith evidence, specify criteria for selecting historical reports, and make interpretive differences explicit.

The practical next step is to examine how an Islamic school actually conducts consultation: who is invited, whose proposals shape decisions, and how outcomes are reviewed. Interviews,

© 2026 Umayah & Dinata. Published by CV. Assyfa Tutoring, Indonesia

meeting records, and observations could test whether the conceptual framework appears in practice and whether participation is experienced as meaningful by staff and families.

5. CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS

A reading of Qur'an 3:159 and 42:38, considered alongside selected accounts of prophetic leadership, frames deliberation as both an ethical disposition of leaders and a collective way of handling affairs. For Islamic education management, this reading suggests consultative planning, defined participation, accountable implementation, and constructive evaluation.

These are conceptual implications. The present literature analysis cannot establish the effectiveness of any proposed procedure. Historical details, source selection, and school-level applications require closer textual verification and empirical investigation.

REFERENCES

Al-Maraghi, A. M. (1993). *Tafsir al-Maraghi*. Toha Putra.

Al-Qurtubi, M. A. (2006). *Tafsir al-Qurtubi*. Pustaka Azzam.

Argyris, C., & Schön, D. A. (1978). *Organizational learning: A theory of action perspective*. Addison-Wesley.

Bass, B. M., & Riggio, R. E. (2006). *Transformational leadership* (2nd ed.). Psychology Press. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781410617095

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology, 3*(2), 77–101. https://doi.org/10.1191/1478088706qp063oa

Bush, T. (2020). *Theories of educational leadership and management* (5th ed.). SAGE Publications.

Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2018). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches* (4th ed.). SAGE Publications.

Dinata, F. R., Manan, A., & Novianti, D. (2024). Peran kepemimpinan kepala sekolah dalam meningkatkan suasana disiplin kerja tenaga guru di SMK Negeri 1 Pakuan Ratu. *Islamic Management: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam, 1*(1), 31–43. https://doi.org/10.63097/bpgf3242

Edmondson, A. (1999). Psychological safety and learning behavior in work teams. *Administrative Science Quarterly, 44*(2), 350–383. https://doi.org/10.2307/2666999

Fullan, M. (2001). *Leading in a culture of change*. Jossey-Bass.

Halimatusha'diah, & Rajabi, M. A. (2023). Implementation of participatory leadership in the deliberation of geography teachers in Karawang Regency high school geography. *PANDU: Jurnal Pendidikan Anak dan Pendidikan Umum, 1*(3), 152–159. https://doi.org/10.59966/pandu.v1i3.416

Hamka. (2007). *Tafsir al-Azhar*. Pustaka Panjimas.

Harris, A. (2008). *Distributed school leadership: Developing tomorrow's leaders*. Routledge.

Hayati, F., Zulvira, R., & Gistituati, N. (2021). Educational institutions: Policy and decision-making. *JRTI (Jurnal Riset Tindakan Indonesia), 6*(1), 100. https://doi.org/10.29210/3003911000

Ibn Kathir, I. (2000). *Tafsir Ibn Kathir*. Pustaka Imam Syafii.

© 2026 Umayah & Dinata. Published by CV. Assyfa Tutoring, Indonesia

Ibrahim, A. E., Alfiah, L., & Roesminingsih, E. (2022). Implementation of participatory leadership styles in primary education in the era of the COVID-19 pandemic. *Al-Idarah: Jurnal Kependidikan Islam, 12*(1), 76–86. https://doi.org/10.24042/alidarah.v12i1.10828

Leithwood, K., & Jantzi, D. (2006). Transformational school leadership for large-scale reform: Effects on students, teachers, and their classroom practices. *School Effectiveness and School Improvement, 17*(2), 201–227. https://doi.org/10.1080/09243450600565829

Lestari, S. (2024). Decision making strategies in Islamic educational leadership. *Wahana Pendidikan, 11*(2), 279–294. https://doi.org/10.25157/jwp.v11i2.11864

Merriam, S. B., & Tisdell, E. J. (2016). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation* (4th ed.). Jossey-Bass.

Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldaña, J. (2014). *Qualitative data analysis: A methods sourcebook* (3rd ed.). SAGE Publications.

Northouse, P. G. (2022). *Leadership: Theory and practice* (9th ed.). SAGE Publications.

Patton, M. Q. (2015). *Qualitative research & evaluation methods: Integrating theory and practice* (4th ed.). SAGE Publications.

Qomar, M. (2015). *Manajemen pendidikan Islam: Strategi baru pengelolaan lembaga pendidikan Islam*. Erlangga.

Qutb, S. (2004). *Tafsir fi zilal al-Quran*. Gema Insani Press.

Robinson, V. M. J., Lloyd, C. A., & Rowe, K. J. (2008). The impact of leadership on student outcomes: An analysis of the differential effects of leadership types. *Educational Administration Quarterly, 44*(5), 635–674. https://doi.org/10.1177/0013161X08321509

Salim, D. P. (2018). Islamic politics in the Qur'an (tafsir siyasah surat Ali Imran verse 159). *Aqlam: Journal of Islam and Plurality, 1*(1). https://doi.org/10.30984/ajip.v1i1.499

Senge, P. M. (1990). *The fifth discipline: The art and practice of the learning organization*. Doubleday.

Shihab, M. Q. (2002). *Tafsir al-Misbah: Pesan, kesan dan keserasian al-Quran*. Lentera Hati.

Spillane, J. P. (2006). *Distributed leadership*. Jossey-Bass.

Yin, R. K. (2018). *Case study research and applications: Design and methods* (6th ed.). SAGE Publications.

© 2026 Umayah & Dinata. Published by CV. Assyfa Tutoring, Indonesia